

Marsilius of Padua's use of St. Augustine

With the untimely death of the eminent Marsilian scholar, Dr. de Lagarde, in 1967, the issue raised between himself and Professor Alan Gewirth as to the influence of St. Augustine on Marsilius of Padua remained unresolved. For his part, Gewirth argued that Marsilius was influenced significantly more by Augustine than by any of the other church fathers¹. But de Lagarde makes no such distinction². Elsewhere, I have attempted to demonstrate the correctness of de Lagarde's viewpoint³. Whereas there I based my conclusions on an examination of the political thought of both writers, I am now prepared to further substantiate my earlier position by relying extensively on a textual analysis. This I propose to do by exposing the real sources of Marsilius' references to and quotations from Augustine in the *Defensor Pacis*, and by identifying a pattern in his use of these references and quotations which indicates clearly the mercenary manner in which he employed them.

A brief explanation of the terminology employed and the footnotes used is in order before proceeding. For convenience, I distinguish between « reference » and « simple reference ». By « simple reference » is meant Marsilius' mention or use of Augustine which does not involve quoting from him. By « reference » is meant any use of or mention of Augustine either by means of quoting him or by means of a simple reference. In addition, in an attempt to eliminate extremely lengthy

1. A. GEWIRTH, *Marsilius of Padua, The Defender of Peace*, I, (New York, 1951), especially pp. 37-39.

2. G. de LAGARDE, *Naissance de l'esprit laïque*, II, (Paris, 1948), especially p. 78. More recently, in volume III, (Louvain, 1970), pp. 40-44, of the same work, de Lagarde reviews the whole question of sources in the *Defensor Pacis*. He concludes, as have other commentators, that Marsilius worked mostly from second hand sources. See also Gewirth, *op. cit.*, p. 37, n. 18 ; C. W. PREVITÉ-ORTON, *The Authors Cited in the « Defensor Pacis »*, in *Essays in History Presented to R. L. Poole* (Oxford, 1927), pp. 405-420.

3. D. G. MULCAHY, *The Influence of St. Augustine on the Defensor Pacis of Marsilius of Padua* (Unpublished Master's Thesis, University College, Dublin, 1967), pp. 26-61.

footnotes, I have added three appendices to the regular footnotes. By using the footnotes, where appropriate, to refer to the appendices, which in turn locate the sources referred to, a great amount of repetition and possible confusion can be avoided.

In the *Defensor Pacis* Marsilius refers to Augustine either by name or by means of quotation on ninety four occasions⁴. He quotes from him on fifty eight occasions⁵. Of these quotations, all but one appear in Discourse II; one appears in Discourse I; and there are none in Discourse III⁶. Of the fifty eight quotations, eight are repeats in full or in part of previous quotations⁷. Augustine's name is mentioned in connection with the fifty eight quotations on forty eight occasions⁸.

Apart from the fifty eight quotations, there are thirty six simple references to Augustine to be accounted for. Of these, twenty four are mentioned by means of reference back or forward to different quotations;⁹ three by means of reference to a work of Augustine¹⁰; and there are three references to apocryphal works¹¹ of Augustine, apparently unknown by Marsilius to be apocryphal. The remaining six simple references refer to a point previously made or to some generally accepted opinion of Augustine.

In all, eight different works of Augustine are referred to¹². Two of these are referred to twice¹³. Each of the others are referred to once¹⁴. Seven of the fifty eight quotations are taken from seven of these works¹⁵. Of the seven quotations taken from these works, one¹⁶, and possibly a second¹⁷, is taken first-hand from Augustine. Of the remaining fifty six quotations, all have been taken from second-hand sources: thirty five of them from the *Collectanea* of Peter Lombard¹⁸; eleven from the *Catenâ Aurea* of St. Thomas Aquinas¹⁹; four from the *Glossa Ordinaria*

4. See APPENDIX I.

5. See APPENDIX II.

6. See APPENDIX I.

7. *Ibid.*, nos 24, 38, 40, 42, 69, 89, 93, 94.

8. He is not mentioned in connection with nos. 4, 5, 18, 21, 58, 60, 80, 86, 93, 94 of APPENDIX I.

9. *Ibid.*, nos 8, 10, 15, 19, 22, 23, 26, 29, 32, 39, 41, 47, 49, 57, 65, 66, 70, 71, 72, 74, 76, 78, 83, 90.

10. *Ibid.*, nos 1, 64, 90.

11. *Ibid.*, nos 56, 61, 88.

12. See APPENDIX III.

13. *Ibid.*, nos 1, 8; 2, 10.

14. *Ibid.*, nos 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9.

15. *Ibid.*, nos 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9.

16. *Ibid.*, no 8.

17. *Ibid.*, no 2.

18. See APPENDIX II.

19. *Ibid.*

of Walafrid Strabo²⁰; two from the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard²¹; two from the *Decretum* of Gratian²²; and two from the protest of the Franciscan Chapter General on July 15, 1322, against Pope John XXII's Bull of suspension, *Quia nonnumquam*, of March 26, 1322²³.

Of all of the quotations from Augustine, eight appear in conjunction with quotations from one or more other commentators²⁴. On two occasions, Augustine is knowingly quoted in opposition to Marsilius' own position²⁵. Twice also, the quotations of Augustine occur within quotations of passages from Peter Lombard by Marsilius²⁶. There is also one quotation²⁷ and one reference²⁸ to *Quaestiones Veteris et Novi Testamenti*, and one quotation²⁹ from *De vera et falsa poenitentia*, two works no longer considered belonging to Augustine³⁰.

Beyond the actual sources from which Marsilius took his quotations of Augustine, the stage in the *Defensor Pacis* at which he introduces them is also of considerable significance. As Professor D'Entrèves has argued, the major theses of Marsilius' own position are set forth in Discourse I³¹. However, it is not until Discourse II that Marsilius makes use of Augustine. There he sets out to support his general ideas with the support of scripture. Working as he did from the highly glossated medieval bible texts, Marsilius had before him texts which contained commentaries by many of the saints and fathers of the church. These had been extracted by the great medieval compilers, notably Peter Lombard, from the original writings and inserted near passages of the bible text which they attempted to explain. Consequently, when Marsilius secured a scriptural quotation supporting his position, he frequently inserted with it into his own work, by means of commentary on or interpretation of the scriptural passage, the explanation of one or more of the saints or fathers which had been

20. *Ibid.*

21. *Ibid.*

22. *Ibid.*

23. See C. W. Previt -Orton, ed. *The Defensor Pacis of Marsilius of Padua* (Cambridge, 1928). Professor Previt -Orton has done extensive work in locating precisely the sources of Marsilius' quotations. In this he was assisted by Marsilius himself who frequently indicates his sources, though not with the precision of modern scholarship. GEWIRTH, *op. cit.*, II, concurs almost entirely with Previt -Orton's findings.

24. See APPENDIX I, nos 4, 5, 16, 17, 60, 81, 91, 92. Ambrose is usually one of these commentators.

25. See APPENDIX I, nos 75, 89.

26. *Ibid.*, nos 36, 48.

27. *Ibid.*, no 56.

28. *Ibid.*, no 88.

29. *Ibid.*, no 61.

30. I have not included the quotations from these works in APPENDIX II.

31. See A. P. D'ENTR VES, *The Medieval Contribution to Political Thought* (Oxford, 1939), p. 52.

considered by the medieval compilers, and not necessarily by Marsilius himself, to be a satisfactory explanation of the bible text.

Thus, of the thirty five quotations of Augustine taken by Marsilius from the *Collectanea* of Peter Lombard, they are all, with the exception of one of doubtful origin³², used in the *Defensor Pacis*, either : to support Marsilius' particular use of scripture on a point, or to explain a quotation from St. Paul, which was a little difficult to understand. Sometimes the explanation is simply that offered by Peter Lombard. Frequently also, the entire passage from Peter Lombard, including the scriptural quotation and commentary on it by Augustine, is taken *en bloc* from the *Collectanea*. The same pattern is seen in the quotations taken from the *Catena Aurea* of St. Thomas, but in this case the scriptural passages are from the gospels.

In the quotations from the *Glossa Ordinaria*, two of them follow the same pattern found in connection with those from the *Collectanea* and the *Catena Aurea*, being a commentary on passages from the gospels. The ambiguity surrounding the source of the other quotations which seem to have come from the *Glossa Ordinaria*³³, and those from the *Decretum* and the protest of the Franciscan Chapter General, makes a similar conclusion regarding them uncertain. Finally, in the case of the two quotations from the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard, whereas they do not follow immediately from any reference to scripture in either the *Defensor Pacis* itself or the *Sentences*, Marsilius is anxious to point out that they are deduced from the scriptures by Peter Lombard.

In addition to the fact that Marsilius took most of his references to Augustine from second-hand sources, the actual number of quotations from Augustine can be equally misleading unless they also are given close attention. Not until it is seen how unevenly these references are distributed throughout the *Defensor Pacis* does Marsilius' use of Augustine come to be seen as quite limited in fact. It has been seen already that with one exception all the quotations of Augustine appear in Discourse II. In addition, it should be noted that for the most part these quotations are centered on only five issues, and that even here there is quite an amount of superfluous quoting, one point sometimes being backed up by three or four quotations. Besides, and this will account in part for the concentration of so many quotations on the same points, many of the quotations of Augustine are taken from almost the same source. Thus for example, of the thirty five quotations taken from the *Collectanea*, nine are taken from pages 1571-1578 of volume 191 and ten from pages 103-114 of volume 192 of Migne's *Patrologia Latina*³⁴. Further-

32. See APPENDIX II, n^o 27.

33. Previt -Orton, ed. *Defensor Pacis*, p. 161, n. 3 ; p. 194, n. 1.

34. See APPENDIX II, n^{os} 12, 24, 25, 30, 31, 55, 56, 57, 58 ; and *Ibid.*, n^{os} 34, 37, 38, 39, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53.

more, there are eight repeated quotations ; there is only meagre reference to the original works of Augustine, only two being known first-hand ; and eight quotations of Augustine, as was seen, appear in conjunction with quotations from other commentators. There are ten quotations from Augustine which are not attributed to him and three simple references refer to works of Pseudo-Augustine, not of Augustine as Marsilius had thought. And there are two quotations of Augustine that are cited in opposition to Marsilius' own views. Indeed, not only are these indications of Marsilius' limited use of Augustine. They also emphasize his lack of competent acquaintance with the work of Augustine.

And it is this lack of real acquaintance on the part of Marsilius with both the thought and the works of Augustine that emerges from any detailed analysis of Marsilius' use of Augustine in the *Defensor Pacis*. Nor is this gainsaid by the fact that Augustine is quoted by Marsilius more frequently than any of the other fathers of the early church. As a matter of fact, the very priority frequency in the quotations from Augustine, Ambrose, and Jerome, found in the *Defensor Pacis*, corresponds with that which obtains in the entire body of medieval writings³⁵. So, then, the slightly greater number of quotations taken from Augustine by Marsilius might be explained to a certain extent — and all the more so by the very manner in which Marsilius took them — by the fact that they were more frequently available to Marsilius than were those of Ambrose or Jerome or anyone else.

In this essay I have pointed out that one of the main purposes of Discourse II of the *Defensor Pacis* was to secure scriptural support for Marsilius' position, as laid down largely in Discourse I. This done, he employed any commentary on the scriptural passage which was appropriate and convenient. In many instances Augustine served this latter purpose. But to suggest that Augustine meant any more than this is not supported by the facts available. Certainly, they do not support the contention of Gewirth that Marsilius' quotations from Augustine are « determined by the central dualism which permeates the entire political philosophy of St. Augustine, between the city of God and the city of man »³⁶.

35. See J. G. BOUGEROL, *Introduction to the Works of Bonaventure* (New York, 1964), p. 25 ; and GEWIRTH, *op. cit.*, I, p. 37, where he makes an issue of the fact that Augustine is quoted by Marsilius more often than any other commentator on the Bible.

36. GEWIRTH, *op. cit.*, I, p. 37.

APPENDIX I

List of quotations of St. Augustine and of references to him by name, or to a work of his, within the *Defensor Pacis*, in the order of their appearance, and with a brief description of their content.

No.	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	Description
1.	I. IX. 2.	Reference : Origin of governments.
2.	I. XIX. 7.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
3.	II. II. 2.	Quotation : Meaning of church.
4.	II. II. 5.	Quotation : Meaning of spiritual.
5.	II. II. 6.	Quotation : Meaning of spiritual.
6.	II. IV. 2.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
7.	II. IV. 5.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
8.	II. IV. 5.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
9.	II. IV. 5.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
10.	II. IV. 5.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
11.	II. IV. 6.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
12.	II. IV. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
13.	II. IV. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
14.	II. IV. 12.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
15.	II. IV. 12.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
16.	II. V. 2.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
17.	II. V. 4.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
18.	II. V. 4.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
19.	II. V. 4.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
20.	II. V. 4.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
21.	II. V. 4.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
22.	II. V. 5.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
23.	II. V. 5.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
24.	II. V. 5.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
25.	II. V. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
26.	II. V. 7.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
27.	II. V. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
28.	II. V. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
29.	II. V. 7.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
30.	II. V. 8.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
31.	II. V. 9.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
32.	II. VI. 3.	Reference : Power of the keys.
33.	II. VI. 3.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
34.	II. VI. 6.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
35.	II. VI. 6.	Reference : Power of the keys.
36.	II. VI. 8.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
37.	II. VI. 13.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
38.	II. VI. 13.	Quotation : Power of the keys.
39.	II. VI. 13.	Reference : Power of the keys.
40.	II. IX. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
41.	II. IX. 9.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
42.	II. IX. 10.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
43.	II. IX. 10.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
44.	II. X. 2.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.

<i>No.</i>	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	<i>Description</i>
45.	II. XIII. 5.	Quotation : Status of supreme poverty.
46.	II. XIII. 5.	Quotation : Status of supreme poverty.
47.	II. XIII. 5.	Reference : Status of supreme poverty.
48.	II. XIII. 5.	Quotation : Status of supreme poverty.
49.	II. XIII. 31.	Reference : Status of supreme poverty.
50.	II. XIV. 10.	Quotation : Status of supreme poverty.
51.	II. XIV. 12.	Quotation : Status of supreme poverty.
52.	II. XVI. 3.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
53.	II. XVI. 3.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
54.	II. XVI. 4.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
55.	II. XVI. 6.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
56.	II. XVI. 8.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
57.	II. XVI. 9.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
58.	II. XVI. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
59.	II. XVI. 15.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
60.	II. XVII. 2.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
61.	II. XVII. 11.	Reference : Election of priests.
62.	II. XIX. 5.	Quotation : Divine and human writings.
63.	II. XIX. 5.	Quotation : Divine and human writings.
64.	II. XIX. 5.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
65.	II. XIX. 6.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
66.	II. XIX. 6.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
67.	II. XIX. 6.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
68.	II. XIX. 8.	Quotation : Divine and human writings.
69.	II. XIX. 10.	Quotation : Divine and human writings.
70.	II. XIX. 10.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
71.	II. XIX. 10.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
72.	II. XIX. 10.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
73.	II. XX. 11.	Quotation : Defining scripture.
74.	II. XXIV. 15.	Reference : Papal disregard for law.
75.	II. XXVII. 2.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
76.	II. XXVIII. 1.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
77.	II. XXVIII. 1.	Reference : Divine and human writings.
78.	II. XXVIII. 5.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
79.	II. XXVIII. 5.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
80.	II. XXVIII. 8.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
81.	II. XXVIII. 9.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
82.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
83.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
84.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
85.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
86.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
87.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
88.	II. XXVIII. 22.	Reference : Equality of all priests.
89.	II. XXVIII. 28.	Quotation : Equality of all priests.
90.	II. XIX. 4.	Reference : Temporal power of priests.
91.	II. XXIX. 6.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
92.	II. XXIX. 6.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
93.	II. XXIX. 7.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.
94.	II. XXIX. 8.	Quotation : Temporal power of priests.

APPENDIX II

Quotations of St. Augustine within the *Defensor Pacis* in the order of their appearance, giving the source from which Marsilius took them, and a reliable edition in which they may be consulted. In cases where any uncertainty surrounds the source from which Marsilius took the quotations, I refer for consultation to C. W. Previt -Orton's edited version of the *Defensor Pacis*. Page and opening line references are also given to this edition.

Abbreviations used :

- CA *Catena Aurea* (Paris, 1657).
 J Gospel according to St. John, a commentary on.
 M Gospel according to St. Matthew, a commentary on.
 PL *Patrologia Latina*.
 PO Previt -Orton, C. W., ed. *The Defensor Pacis of Marsilius of Padua* (Cambridge, 1928).

No.	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	Marsilius' source	Consult	PO : page-line
1.	I. XIX. 7. Qui prae ceteris [.....] ceteris dotatur clavibus	Glossa Ordinaria	PO p. 104, n. 2	104-12
2.	II. II. 2. « Ecclesiam Dei contemnitis », id est [.....] prodierit vel confugerit	Collectanea	PL 191. 1639	116-15
3.	II. II. 5. scilicet verbum Dei, et mysterium regni caelorum	Collectanea	PL 191. 1609	119-21
4.	II. II. 6. scilicet verbum Dei [.....] carnis indulta sunt ?	Collectanea	PL 191. 1609	120-22
5.	II. IV. 2. « Discite a me » non mundum [.....] sed : « quoniam mitis sum et humilis corde »	Sermo LXXIX	PL 38. 441	129-21
6.	II. IV. 5. Quod si Pilato [.....] credentes in eum.	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 186-187, J	131-5
7.	II. IV. 5. Satis, (inquit Augustinus,) ostendit illud [.....] se diceret regem	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 186-187, J	131-19
8.	II. IV. 6. Non quia regem [.....] carnalis carnaliter dicis	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 186-187, J	132-14
9.	II. IV. 7. A quo descendit [.....] contra ea orare	Catena Aurea	PO p. 133, n. 3	133-13
10.	II. IV. 7. fideles Christiani sunt [.....] ut iam regnaret	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 73-74, J	133-17
11.	II. IV. 12. Discamus ergo quod [.....] sub Caesaris potestate	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 189-190, J	140-3
12.	II. V. 2. Apostoli enim circumeuntes [.....] examinatores esse voluit	Collectanea	PL 191. 1576-77	144-18
13.	II. V. 4. Et hic ad [.....] et aliis huiusmodi	Collectanea	PL 191. 1503-04	147-31
14.	II. V. 4. Quae autem sunt [.....] obtemperandum est Deo	Collectanea	PL 191. 1503-05	149-1

No.	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	<i>Marsilius' source</i>	<i>Consult</i>	<i>PO : page-line</i>
15.	II. v. 4.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1503-06	150-1
		Quasi : merito acquirunt [.....] ministri Dei sunt		
16.	II. v. 5.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1503-05	152-23
		Ergo si aliud imperator, aliud Deus iubeat etc.		
17.	II. v. 7.	Collectanea	PL 192. 335-6	155-4
		« Pro omnibus hominibus », id est [.....] etsi mali sint		
18.	II. v. 7.	Collectanea	PL 192. 335-6	155-10
		Quare autem, (inquit Augustinus,) pro [.....] sine inquietatione aliqua		
19.	II. v. 7.	Collectanea	PL 192. 335-7	155-17
		Ideo Apostolus admonuit [.....] quietam agant vitam		
20.	II. v. 8.	Collectanea	PL 192. 357	156-19
		Sciendum quosdam praedicasse [.....] contra leges praedict		
21.	II. vi. 3.	Glossa Ordinaria	PO p. 161, n. 3	161-21
		Claves sunt discernendi [.....] debet a regno		
22.	II. vi. 6.	Sententiae	PL 192. 386	163-9
		Nemo tollit peccata [.....] tollens peccata mundi		
23.	II. vi. 8.	Sententiae	PL 192. 888	166-9
		Quibus remittunt, remittit [.....] peccatores exercere nequeunt		
24.	II. vi. 13.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1571	171-26
		Hoc modo iudicavi [.....] tradatis Satanae huiusmodi		
25.	II. vi. 13.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1571	172-15
		Ut vos congregati in unum, absque aliqua dissensione		
26.	II. ix. 7.	Glossa Ordinaria	PL 114. 148	192-1
		Forma servi quae [.....] vos mecum iudices		
27.	II. ix. 10.	Collectanea	PO p. 194, n. 1	194-6
		in diaboli baratrum devolutos		
28.	II. ix. 10.	Collectanea	PL 192. 357	194-9
		Non ergo exigant [.....] de Hebraeis dicitur		
29.	II. XIII. 5.	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 62-65, M	225-13
		Si pro necessariis [.....] magis pro superfluis ?		
30.	II. XIII. 5.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1578	225-21
		Hoc secundum veniam [.....] fratres fratribus iudicantibus		
31.	II. XIII. 5.	Collectanea	PL 191. 1578	225-25
		Ut autem praedicta [.....] habendo contra fratrem		
32.	II. XIV. 10.	Collectanea	PL 191. 367-8	250-34
		Hoc ideo dicit [.....] eius implicaretur intentio		
33.	II. XIV. 12.	Catena Aurea	CA pp. 118-119, M	252-7
		Illa loquebatur apostolis [.....] nulla superflua requirentibus		
34.	II. XVI. 3.	Collectanea	PL 192. 107	274-35
		Illi « qui videbantur esse aliquid », [.....] meae perfectioni adderent		
35.	II. XVI. 3.	Collectanea	PL 192. 93-5	275-15
		Ceteri enim apostoli [.....] alios per mortalem		
36.	II. XVI. 4.	Collectanea	PL 192. 98-9	275-27
		« Notum enim vobis [.....] secundum hominem » docentem me vel [.....] docente me, « sed per revelationem Iesu Christi »		
37.	II. XVI. 6.	Collectanea	PL 192. 103	277-30
		Et non didici [.....] amicis et paribus		
38.	II. XVI. 10.	Collectanea	PL 192. 107-8	280-26
		Quia honoratiores erant [.....] cum Domino fuerunt		

No.	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	<i>Marsilius' source</i>	<i>Consult</i>	<i>PO : page-line</i>
39.	II. XVII. 2.	Collectanea Christus enim dedit [.....] ut ministraret Iudaeis	PL, 192. 107-8	289-15
40.	II. XIX. 5.	Decretum Ego enim fateor [.....] aberret persuadere potuerunt	PO p. 314, n. 2	314-18
41.	II. XIX. 5.	Decretum Noli (lector scilicet) meis litteris [.....] noli firmiter tenere	PO p. 315, n. 1	314-29
42.	II. XIX. 8.	Protest of 1322 Ego vero non [.....] ecclesiae commoveret auctoritas	PO p. 316, n. 2	314-4
43.	II. XIX. 10.	Protest of 1322 Non crederem Evangelio etc.	PO p. 316, n. 2	317-21
44.	II. XX. 11.	De Civitate Dei ista quae a [.....] impellente, seipsa subvertunt	PL, 41. 210	324-27
45.	II. XXVII. 2.	Catena Aurea Duas vitas sibi [.....] sui apostolatus primatum	CA pp. 208-209, J	425-21
46.	II. XXVIII. 5.	Catena Aurea Dixi in quodam [.....] dictus est Petrus	CA pp. 181-184, M	435-31
47.	II. XXVIII. 8.	Glossa Ordinaria Et (cum) tertio audit [.....] serviat quam timori	PL, 114. 424	439-7
48.	II. XXVIII. 9.	Collectanea « Cum vidissent quod Evangelium praeputii » a Domino [.....] ut ministraret Iudaeis	PL, 192. 107-8	440-29
49.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Collectanea Et non didici [.....] amicis et paribus	PL, 192. 103	441-18
50.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Collectanea « Mihi enim » vel « autem », quasi [.....] dedit et mihi	PL, 192. 107	442-13
51.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Collectanea Apostolus enim Paulus [.....] dixit, locutus audiatur	PL, 192. 103-4	442-28
52.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Collectanea Unde et contulit [.....] leprae varietate, monstravit	PL, 192. 103-4	443-8
53.	II. XXVIII. 10.	Collectanea « Iterum ascendi Hierosolymam etc. » Ascendi, dico [.....] Apostoli perturbantibus Iudaeis	PL, 192. 103	443-14
54.	II. XXVIII. 28.	Catena Aurea Sic eum volo [.....] sui apostolatus primatum	PO p. 467, n. 4	467-7
55.	II. XXIX. 6.	Collectanea « Saecularia igitur etc. » Sicut iam [.....] adiecit : « Ad verecundiam »	PL, 191. 1576-7	473-15
56.	II. XXIX. 6.	Collectanea apostoli enim praedicando [.....] hoc autem « ad reverentiam vestram dico. »	PL, 191. 1576-7	474-4
57.	II. XXIX. 7.	Collectanea tumultuosas perplexitates causarum de negotiis saecularibus	PL, 191. 1576-7	475-16
58.	II. XXIX. 8.	Collectanea A quibus nos excusare non possumus etsi velimus	PL, 191. 1576-7	476-25

APPENDIX III

List of the works of St. Augustine mentioned by Marsilius which are either referred to, or quoted from, in the *Defensor Pacis*, in the order of their appearance.

<i>No.</i>	<i>Defensor Pacis</i>	<i>Work of Augustine</i>	<i>Description</i>
1.	I. XIX. 7.	De Civitate Dei	Reference
2.	II. IV. 2.	Sermo LXIX	Quotation
3.	II. IX. 10	Ep. CXVI	Quotation
4.	II. XIX. 5.	Ep. LXXXII	Quotation
5.	II. XIX. 5.	De Trinitate	Quotation
6.	II. XIX. 5.	Ep. ad Fortunatum	Reference
7.	II. XIX. 8.	Contra epistolam quam vocant Fun- damentum	Quotation
8.	II. XX. 11.	De Civitate Dei	Quotation
9.	II. XXVIII. 5.	Retractationes	Quotation
10.	II. XXIX. 4.	Sermo LXIX	Reference

Daniel G. MULCAHY
University of New Brunswick
FREDERICTON, Canada